

Yoma 82a

מתני'...חולה — מאכילין אותו על פי בקיאים, ואם אין שם בקיאים — מאכילין אותו על פי עצמו עד שיאמר די.

MISHNA: ...If a person is **ill** [on Yom Kippur] and requires food due to potential danger, **one feeds him according to** the advice of medical **experts** who determine that he indeed requires food. **And if there are no experts there, one feeds him according to his own** instructions, **until he says** that he has eaten **enough** and needs no more.

Yoma 83a

אמר ר' ינאי חולה אומר צריך ורופא אומר אינו צריך שומעין לחולה מ"ט לב יודע מרת נפשו פשיטא מהו דתימא רופא קים ליה טפי קמ"ל

It was taught in the mishna: If a person is **ill** and requires food due to potential danger, **one feeds him according to** the advice of medical **experts**. **Rabbi Yannai said:** If an **ill person says** he **needs** to eat, and a **doctor says he does not need** to eat, **one listens to the ill person**. **What is the reason** for this *halakha*? It is because the verse states: **"The heart knows the bitterness of its soul"** (Proverbs 14:10), meaning an ill person knows the intensity of his pain and weakness, and doctors cannot say otherwise. The Gemara asks: It is **obvious** that a person knows himself better than anyone else does. Why does this need to be stated explicitly? The Gemara answers: It is **lest you say** that **the doctor is more certain** because he has had more experience with this condition. Therefore, the verse **teaches us** that even so, it is the ill person who knows his own suffering better than anyone else.

תנן: חולה — מאכילין אותו על פי בקיאים. על פי בקיאים — אין, על פי עצמו — לא! על פי בקיאים — אין, על פי בקי אֶחָד — לא! §

We learned in the mishna: If a person is **ill**, **one feeds him according to** the advice of medical **experts**. This implies that if there are experts present, then **according to** the advice of **experts, yes**, one feeds the ill person; but at **his own** instructions, **no**, one does not feed him, contrary to Rabbi Yannai's opinion. It further implies that **according to** the advice of several **experts, yes**, one feeds an ill person; however, **according to** the advice of only **one expert, no**, one does not feed him. There appears to be a requirement for at least two doctors, which also contradicts Rabbi Yannai's

opinion that the opinion of one expert is sufficient to override the opinion of the ill person.

מר בר רב אשי אָמַר: כּל הֵיכָא דְאָמַר צָרִיךְ אָנִי, אֶפִּילוּ אִיכָא מְאָה דְאָמְרֵי לֹא צָרִיךְ לְדִידֵיהּ שְׁמַעֲיָנָן — שְׁנַאֲמַר: "לֵב יוֹדֵעַ מֵרַת נַפְשׁוֹ".

Mar bar Rav Ashi said: Any instance where an ill person says: I need to eat, even if there are one hundred expert doctors who say that he does not need to eat, we listen to his own opinion and feed him, as it is stated: "The heart knows the bitterness of its soul" (Proverbs 14:10).

תָּנִן: אִם אֵין שָׁם בְּקִיָּאִין — מְאָכִילִין אוֹתוֹ עַל פִּי עֲצָמוֹ. טַעְמָא דְלִיכָא בְּקִיָּאִין, הָא אִיכָא בְּקִיָּאִין לָא! הֵכִי קְאָמַר: בְּמָה דְבָרִים אָמוּרִים — דְאָמַר "לֹא צָרִיךְ אָנִי", שְׁנַאֲמַר: "לֵב יוֹדֵעַ מֵרַת נַפְשׁוֹ".

We learned in the mishna: **If** an ill person himself says he needs to eat and **there are no experts present, one feeds him according to his own opinion.** This implies that **the reason** one feeds him **is** because **there are no experts** present. One may infer from this that if **there were experts** present, **no**, one would not feed the ill person based on his own opinion but would instead listen to the advice of the experts. The Gemara rejects this: **This is** what the mishna **is saying: In what case is this statement** that one follows the opinion of the experts **said?** It is **when** the ill person **said: I do not need** to eat.